

Adapted from: Cambridge Primary Review Trust / University of York (2015) *The CPRT/UoY Dialogic Teaching Project, trial stage 2015-16: handbook for schools*. York: University of York, 51-64.

TALK TRANSCRIBED

When we observe teaching on video we may tend to be more interested in what we see than what we hear; that is, behaviour rather than words, or how participants interact rather than what they say and mean. In contrast, although transcripts give us few clues about intonation and the other paralinguistic aspects of communication - facial expression, gesture, body language and so on - they do at least force us to attend to meaning.

Some of the examples below come from the professional development video which is accessible separately. Footnotes indicate this and other sources, one of which is a classic instance of recitation analysed many years ago by Douglas Barnes, one of the key figures in the development of our understanding of classroom talk.

Transcribing conventions and stage directions have been kept to a minimum. T = teacher. P1, P2 and so on = individual pupils. PP = several pupils speaking simultaneously. PPP = whole class speaking simultaneously (which occurs only in extract 1). Underlining indicates overlapping turns.

ROTE

Extract 1¹

T Right, so this afternoon, we are going to start our lesson on a counting stick, so can you all see? [*Holds up counting stick*]. Robin, turn around so you can see. Turn your chair around please. If I say this is zero [*pointing to zero on stick*] that's zero, does that give you a clue?

PP No.

T No.

If I say that's five [*pointing to 5 line*] and that's eight [*pointing to 8 line*], does that give you a clue?

PP Yes.

T Yes, what's the clue Jonathan?

P1 It's eight kilometres in five miles.

T Eight kilometres to every five miles, so we're going to count. Okay? Are we ready then? [*Points to counting stick, moving on in stages to signalling when Ps should speak*].

PPP [*Chanting in unison as T points each time first to miles and then to kilometres*].

¹ Video, extract 2.

Zero, zero ... Five, eight ... Ten, sixteen ... Fifteen, twenty four ... Twenty, thirty two... Twenty five, forty ... Thirty, forty eight ... Thirty five, fifty six ... Forty, sixty four ... Forty five, seventy two ... Fifty, eighty.

T Well done, so we're going backwards now. We've got the reverse gear on and we're going backwards. Going from kilometres to miles, okay?

PPP [*Again chanting in unison as teacher points to intervals on the counting stick*]. Eighty, fifty ... seventy two, forty five ... sixty four, forty ... fifty six, thirty five ... forty eight, thirty ... forty, twenty five ... thirty two, twenty ... twenty four, fifteen ... sixteen, ten ... eight, five ... zero, zero.

RECITATION

Extract 2²

T Now what do we mean by language?

P1 The alphabet.

T That's part of it ... what else?

P2 How to speak.

T How to speak ... yes ... What else? ... What else do you do with a language apart from speaking it?

P3 Pronounce it?

T Well that's part of speaking ... What else?

P4 Learn to say it.

T Still the same thing ... Yes?

P5 Sir, you can tell the countries by the language they speak.

T Yes, but what else can we use a language for? We don't always speak a language ... I don't always speak a language when I want to get something over to someone who is not in the same room ... probably a long way away ... I can't shout or use the telephone ... What do I do?

P5 Write

T I write ... right, therefore it's the written word as well as the spoken word.

Extract 3³

T [*A pupil has just finished writing his 'make 16' calculation on the blackboard. Teacher to class*] Do you agree with that one? [*Pupils murmur. Pupil at board returns to his seat*] 100,000 take away 100,000 is going to be nothing. Add sixteen, and have our sixteen. Take away nine. / What are we going to get to? Take away nine?

P1 Seven

T Seven. Then add three, A, where are we up to?

P2 Ten

² Barnes, D., Britton, J., Rosen, H. (1971) *Language, the Learner and the School*, Penguin, pp 29-30.

³ Alexander, R.J. (2001) *Culture and Pedagogy: international comparisons in primary education*, Blackwell, pp 486-7 (England).

T Ten. Add four?

A Fourteen.

T Fourteen. Add 2?

P3 Sixteen. [*Pupils raise hands to be chosen to go to the board*].

[*Later in lesson*]

T Right, um, [*walks to side table and picks up worksheets*] Year 5, er, last week we were looking at patterns in number. You're going to be doing a bit more on that today with magic squares. [*Walks to front of class*]. So you're working on the sheet, OK? [*Holds up worksheet*]. And you're trying to complete the magic squares and these ones there, the examples I've given you, have got a magic number of fifteen. What do we mean when we say a magic square? [*No response*] Does C know the answer? Come on. I'm sure you'll have come across these before. Magic square, why are they called magic? / Er, D?

P4 Because all the numbers across and down and diagonally are the same.

T Equal, the same number, very good. So all the numbers [*indicates the dimensions on the worksheet*] across, downwards or diagonally equal the same number. So if I tell you these have got a magic number of fifteen, what does that mean, E, on these squares? / [*No response*]. That if we add the numbers across, they're going to come to what total? / If you add these numbers here, [*points to partly-completed square on worksheet*] if we had the right numbers in, what total would it come to if it's a magic square of fifteen? / [*No response*] Anyone help her out? F?

P5 Fifteen.

T It's gonna come to fifteen. So if we add the top numbers [*points to the numbers*] – that first – the first three numbers across, that's got to come to fifteen. And then if we add the numbers going down that's got to come to fifteen as well. And if we add the diagonal, that's corner to corner, that's got to come to fifteen as well. So you've got to fill in the numbers so that they're going to come – add up – total fifteen. OK? And then, when you've done that, it tells you that you've got a bit more to do further down here. I'll probably come round and help you with that if you get stuck. You've got to see whether you can make up a magic square, add ten to your numbers and whether that's going to make a difference, whether it's still going to be a magic square, but start with these and then I'll come round to you.

INSTRUCTION

Extract 4⁴

T [*To whole class*]. Right guys, I'm going to stop you now.

We've already shared quite a lot and now you've worked in your little expert groups, so what I want to do now is pull out the experts from the groups and put you into bigger groups, like we've done before so that we've got this jigsaw feel.

If you want to use whiteboards this time around, that's fine because you might actually be wanting to think about the scores on the fortune lines now, although what I really don't want to happen is everybody getting obsessed with 'Oh, this is definitely a minus three', 'Oh, I think it's

⁴ Video, extract 6.

a minus four'. The numbers I suppose, if it comes down to it, are less important than the reasons for having them. Alright?

So don't get too wound up about whether you agree that this is a four or whatever, don't worry about that because obviously we know we don't have to agree all the time and surely with this one, there is no right answer. That's the whole point of all of this. That's why fortune lines are so intriguing to do, isn't it? Because there is no 'I don't know the right answer' because there is no one right answer. It's just an opinion and it's whether you can support it. That is really what we are thinking about.

So we need to move the tables so that we've got the bigger groups. All right?

EXPOSITION

Extract 5⁵

T *[To whole class]*. When people are fleeing their country it isn't just about turning up on the doorstep of another country. There are many decisions that will have to be made before they actually do that and these people may well have encountered dangers and threatening situations like this family in the text here.

Mrs Armitage's brother-in-law was in a very similar situation. He is Vietnamese, he comes from Vietnam and his family had very important decisions to make as well. And for him, his decision was that he had to stay behind and the reason he had to stay behind is because he has polio and polio is a disease which means that your ability to walk is affected. Do you think that was an easy decision for the family to make? Just think about that.

ONE-TO-ONE DISCUSSION: PUPIL - PUPIL

Extract 6⁶

T *[To small group]*. Right, just one that I'd like you to talk to your partners about here. *[Shows card to Ps and reads slowly and emphatically]* Were Tukku Tukku's actions right or wrong?

Could you just have a chat with your partners about that just while I go and get check that everybody's getting on alright? It's sort of a *moral* dilemma now Adam. Right or wrong? Were they right or wrong? It's not about if you were Tukku Tukku, was it right? Was it wrong? OK? *[Teacher moves to another group]*.

P1 He was right, because if he hadn't...

P2 He wasn't right though, because he doesn't need to kill him.

P1 No, I don't think ... *[This paired discussion continues, but camera moves to P3 and P4, who are having a separate discussion]*.

P3 He practically suffocated him to say that he is drunk...

P4 I think to really gain respect, maybe he should have ... I don't think really he suffocated him because that's just going too far.

P3 Yeah, that's a bit too far.

⁵ Video, extract 8.

⁶ Video, extract 10.

- P4 But I think to actually prove his point he should actually maybe just have a little fight to actually say that he maybe he is actually the same.
- P3 Yeah, but a little fight's not going to prove anything. Though actually his actions were wise when he started toward at the end here... I think when they fight ...
- P4 He could have just got him in a headlock and then nearly killed him.
- P1 [*Camera moves back to first pair*] Angry, so really they ...
- P2 It was kind of wrong because, from Tukku Tukku's perspective, because he was suffocating, because he had him in a head lock. He knew that he had to do something fast otherwise it could be a sticky end. I think what it is, is that he thought really fast to do something, that he'd better do something, so I think it's right ...

ONE-TO-ONE DISCUSSION: TEACHER - PUPIL

Extract 7⁷

- T [*From same lesson as Extract 6*]. What were you thinking about that one?
- P1 It's also a risk that if Samson's managed to beat Tukku Tukku all those times because, how do you know that if they carry on fighting that he, that he might be the one that gets his head trapped? And so he might have involuntarily acted and the boys might have pounced on him. And then the boys might have joined in the fight too, and because he had done it and they had saved him. Instead they were still on his side until he like filled the bucket and gave it.
- T So ... is there still going to be this power struggle?
- P1 There is, because ...
- T How can you see it resolving then?
- P1 I think he might ... because ... [*Checks story sheet*] ... when do the boys notice that he's grown?.
- T That's at the very end. That is at the very end.
- P1 Oh well, they notice he's grown but if he carried on they might notice he'd grown and so they might still be acting the same as they did, but they do know that he is able to beat Samson so they might not be so mean to him and not try and fight him as much but they will try and still show who's boss.
- T But do you really think that boys think like that? I mean I don't mean any disrespect to the boys here, that people do think like that. Don't you think that people are either very sort of, that it's like they're, this way or it's that way, it's black or it's white, that, 'Oh, he's getting a bit better, he's getting a bit stronger.' Do you think they actually would *slowly* gain respect for him?
- P1 Yes, kind of, but what I'm trying to say is maybe they are, because he didn't fill the bucket and so they might think that they should go on his side, but they may be too scared to because they don't want to, Samson to go, trying to suffocate them.
- T But there could be what we might call split allegiance, they could see who the one who's gaining the power is, but they know who needs to have the power and the control.

⁷ Video, extract 14.

- P1 Yes.
- T What do you think about that? Could you see that happening? How would you resolve that one?
- P1 Hmm ... that's rather hard ... Well maybe if they... well he's like, they did decide to go to them but Tukku Tukku might not want to fight straight after them again because you never know, he might be twice as much to be beaten because he's already been through it once, he needs to beat him again, so he might be, so Samson might also be stronger because he had been beaten, he needs to show him that that was a once opportunity and that he really is powerful to the boys but the boys, if he wins the fight the boys might stay with him, but if they have another fight ...
- T Who wins the fight?
- P1 Er, Samson.
- T Right.
- P1 Though if Tukku Tukku wins the fight again, they might start like not telling Samson what they think of Richard now, not Richard, what they think of Tukku Tukku, and then they might change. They won't actually say it to his face, but they might not like, yeah it says, yeah, yeah, when he was doing all that, they might not join as much as they used to do.
- T Now I'm wondering who's actually got the power in the story?
- P1 Samson at the beginning, but at the end, none of them actually needed to have the power because they're all just friends.

GROUP DISCUSSION: PUPIL-LED

Extract 8⁸

- P1 [reading] The moon shines because it's alight.
- P2 Alight ... ?
- P3 Um, I think, yeah, it is alight but um, it doesn't exactly shine.
- P1 Shine.
- P3 It doesn't shine that much, it is, it's like it is really bright white.
- P1 Like a bright white.
- P3 'Cos it's really dark at night.
- P1 Yes.
- P3 So it brights up, cos, once there was a full moon, every time that there's a full moon for some reason you can see a smiley face on, on the moon and when you see that smiley face on the moon, you can see, you can see this um, you can see light around it and it's, and it shines really brightly and ...
- P1 Ah, I know what you mean there.

⁸ Mercer, N. and Dawes, L. (2008), The value of exploratory talk, in N.Mercer and S.Hodgkinson (ed), *Exploring Talk in Schools*, Sage, pp 67-8.

- P3 Yes, and it doesn't mean that it's alight, it's just really shiny, really bright white.
- P1 OK, so what shall we say?
- P2 I think we should do ... true.
- P1 I'm not sure, I'm not really sure that it is, um, why don't we say unsure?
- P3 Yes, 'cos I mean, it is a bright white moon, it, it's not alight.
- P1 Yes.
- P3 It hasn't got a light bulb in it has it?

GROUP DISCUSSION: TEACHER-LED

Extract 9⁹

- T *[Same lesson as Extracts 6 and 7. [Holds card up so pupils can see and slowly and deliberately reads this question from it] 'What if Richard had not filled the bucket?' [Long thinking pause] M'mm ...*
- P1 *[Signals he wants to speak but thinks carefully first].* I think they would the same power because it's like Tukku Tukku didn't shake Richard's hand and Richard, Richard didn't fill the bucket. So they'd be just the same, just have the same power.
- P2 I think he would probably like, like fight until he did because he would like, he wanted to get the respect from him, so he would have to like say he shouldn't be getting in another headlock because he was like, if he didn't, he wouldn't have the self, he wouldn't have the respect for him.
- T So you're saying that it would carry on? The fighting would still carry ...
- P2 It did, but they wouldn't, it wouldn't be, it wouldn't kind of be as long, it wouldn't have, they would probably fight a bit harder because they want, because Stephen or Tukku Tukku would probably bond them, he'd want them to guess, would want him to get himself some respect.
- T I'm just a bit worried though about how if they carry on fighting...
- P2 Yes.
- T ... you know, that it actually could end up with very nasty consequences, the way that they've been trying to...
- P2 Hmm, but...
- T It could be an outcome.
- P2 Even... but at least he would have proved his point.
- T But that's quite a crucial way of proving your point, isn't it?
- P2 Yes, but if somebody's been doing that for that long and they don't mean to get it, I think if you wanted to get some respect you would probably do it because...
- P1 So if he suffocated him, at least he proved his point?
- P2 Hmm.
- P2 If he like, if he like got, if he got, if he was like unconscious, but he wasn't, then he let him go,

⁹ Video, extract 14.

and then he did fill up the bucket, at least he would know and then also he wouldn't, Samson wouldn't come back and he wouldn't like to try and fight him again.

P1 He was unconscious, but he wasn't...

T Yes, I think that's slightly confusing that bit, but I do know what you are saying ...

[For another example of teacher-led small group discussion, from a different school, see Extract 13].

WHOLE CLASS DIALOGUE

Extract 10¹⁰

T Can we have the last group please? [*Sam comes to front. The flipchart sheet prepared by his group is on the board behind him*]. Thank you. Okay, Sam.

P1 [*To class*]. We thought if people were naughty we would punish them. And first we would give them a warning. And second, we would ration them for food for about two days. And then they'd have to clear the toilets and the rubbish pit, like pushing down the waste in the pit so it's really full with rubbish. And if you disobeyed the rules again, you'd have to be punished quite badly. We didn't really know how badly to do it or what to do it. But also we thought keep the population low because the tribe would get very big and people don't fall out as much.

T How would you keep the tribe low?

P1 Um, well, tell them that they're not to have too many children. And if anybody does come onto the island, tell them to like go off.

T So you wouldn't accept outsiders into your community?

P1 Unless it was really necessary. If it wasn't necessary, we wouldn't.

T And you would tell families ... You would indicate how many children they had to have? Did all of your group agree with that?

PP Yes.

T Why, why would you choose to do that?

P1 Well, to keep the population low because like it's easier to keep the crime down.

T It's easier to keep crime down.

P1 Yes.

T What if there was, on this particular island that you found there was actually quite a lot of food, there was plenty of fresh water, there were springs up in the mountains, there was enough to go around, would you still feel the need to actually monitor how many children people were having?

P1 We might make it a bit higher, the punishment bit, but not too high ...

T Right. Okay ... What do other people think about that? Catherine what do you think?

P2 How would you stop like ladies having like two or three children? Would you have to like kill the babies as soon as like they come out of ...?

P1 Can't mothers choose how many children they have?

¹⁰ Video, extract 21.

- T Can they?
Can they?
- P1 I think so ... Probably ...
- P3 You can only choose if they have like three children. If they only wanted to, you can put one up for adoption.
- T And then they would still live on the island, wouldn't they?
- P4 You could tell them unless you had twins.
- T We're into interesting ground here aren't we? Georgia?
- P5 How many you can choose ... [*inaudible*] to have more than three?
- P1 About two or three.
- P3 What if they're having triplets, they're like, sometimes women have like four or five ...
- T Triplets they would have three, wouldn't they? But it's possible isn't it? Somebody might have triplets and then what would you do then? They would need some system of birth control. If this is the system you're talking about then they would need some system of birth control and contraception wouldn't they?
- P1 [*Inaudible*] ... government so you'd have like health and safety.
- T Alright.
- P1 And like cow's milk ... [*inaudible*].
- T So the minister in charge of health and safety would be responsible for this.
- P1 Oh yes. It would be like a ... [*inaudible*].
- T Right, okay. Some very, very interesting ideas. Thank you Sam.

Extract 11¹¹

- T [*Monitoring pairs and individuals. Stops at group of four pupils. Checks G's work and asks her to read to the class her narrative so far. Then:*] A, read us the beginning of your story.
- P1 [*Reads aloud to the class*]. 'Fear. On 29th January, in an aeroplane, M Jean and M Marc met / in chance. M Jean...'
- T Perhaps that should be 'by chance' [*Teacher has corrected the pupil's 'en surprise' to 'par surprise'*].
- P1 'M Jean said, "Hallo Marc, how are you?" "I'm very busy. I work in accounts" [*Les comptes*] and ...'
- T Comptes. How do you write that?
- P1 [*Spells aloud*] C-O-N-T-E.
- T What do you mean ? If you write *conte* it means a fairy tale for children.
- P1 I mean at a bank.
- T Ah. Then how do you spell it? H?

¹¹ Alexander, R.J. (2001) *Culture and Pedagogy: international comparisons in primary education*, Blackwell, pp 468-9 (France).

- P2 *[Spells aloud]* C-O-M-P-T-E-S.
- T Good. What is going to happen next, A?
- P1 The plane...*[Pupil next to P1 points to his writing. P1 hasn't anything further to read out, but P1 pushes ahead anyway]* ... the plane...
- T *[Realizes P1 has nothing more to read]* No, imagine that ...
- P1 *[Fluently again, telling rather than reading]* The plane takes off, and they fall backwards into their seats, because they are still standing up.
- T Yes?
- P1 Then they sit down. When the plane gets up into the sky, there will be turbulence. *[Rocks his hand to suggest turbulence]*.
- T Yes. Then, what will happen, because of the turbulence ? How will they feel ?
- P1 Marc will be afraid...
- T Yes ...
- P1 ... And other people will try to reassure him...
- T There!
- P1 ... And many people will be sick.
- T Don't try to put too much into it, but that's good. That is something which might happen. Then everything returns to normal.
- P1 Then - then the pilot will straighten, er / straighten the plane, and everything will come right again.
- T Good. *[To class]* So you see what it is that I want: a conversation, but with an adventure, too. They are in a ship or an aeroplane or a train. But they go somewhere: the ship sets sail, the aeroplane takes off, the train starts ...
- [Later in the same lesson]*
- T *[To class]* But if you were told that the aeroplane had lost an engine...*[Pupils calls out. Teacher nods to P3]*.
- P1 You'd be really frightened.
- T That's right, as A says, you would be really frightened. *[Pupils call out. Teacher points to P3]*.
- P3 The kerosene ... the aeroplane would explode...
- P4 Oh, dear !
- T So. If you were told that, you would be uneasy, you'd be afraid.
- P5 *[Calls out]*. I would hide under the seat.
- T *[Other pupils call out. Teacher gestures them to quieten]*. Wait. You would listen to the air hostess's instructions. What would she tell you to do? *[Pupils call out very excitedly]*. Now, now, wait, wait, wait. What instructions would she give?
- P1 *[Standing]* You would have to put your table up.
- T So you don't hurt yourself.

- P2 Take off your shoes. Put your head between your knees.
- P6 Why?
- T You have to take off your shoes? I didn't know that. That's new. / Yes? [*Points to P7, who has her hand up*].
- P7 Put your life jacket on.
- T Put your life jacket on. Yes. It depends where you are. If you're over the sea. / Not if you're over the Sahara desert.
- P8 [*Calls out*] Put on a parachute.
- T No, there are no parachutes. Just think about it... three hundred passengers. [*To class*] You may have a few more minutes ... Yes? [*Moves to respond to P9, who has her hand up*].
- P9 My mummy gets very scared in aeroplanes, and if they said that she would faint.

Extract 12¹²

- T What I want you to do now ... I want you with your partner to come up with another ingredient ...
- [*Pupils work in pairs for several minutes, exchanging suggestions about key themes in the story under discussion.*]
- T Has anybody come up with any themes? Themes are a bit harder to come up with. Remember we said that themes are big ideas that run throughout the story ... and they're slightly different from your ingredients ... OK, let's talk to ... um ... Patricia and Vikram. Did you come up with a theme?
- P1 Our theme was happiness because at the end of the first story Queen Nyasha was happy with King Nyoko when they were married and in *Sir Gawain and the Loathly Lady* ... [*signals to partner to continue*]
- P2 ... in *Sir Gawain and the Loathly Lady* the beautiful lady and Sir Gawain were happy together and they were ... [*turns to P1*]
- P1 ... having a feast in the hall.
- P2 ... having a feast in the hall, and they were really happy together because they got married and ... also ... [*slows to a halt and turns to P1*]
- T [*To Vikram*] Patricia's asking for some help, Vikram.
- P1 And when they were married [*reads haltingly from the text, with Patricia's assistance*] King Arthur and Queen Guinevere were happy for Sir Gawain and the beautiful lady.
- T [*After a thoughtful pause*] I don't know whether I agree with you that they were happy ... Because when Sir Gawain got married I don't think they were very happy.
- P1 Yeah ... Sir Gawain wasn't happy when ...
- P2 ... the beautiful lady was the loathly lady. But when the Loathly Lady turned into the beautiful lady Sir Gawain was happy ...
- P1 Sir Gawain was happy because she looked more nicer than how she was before.

¹² QCA (2005) *Opening up Talk* (DVD) (Sue Horner and Robin Alexander).

- T [After an encouraging smile at Patricia and Vikram] Rosie ... would you like to identify for us another theme ?
- P3 The theme in the story is bravery in Sir Gawain and the Loathly Lady, because Sir Gawain stands up for the honour of his king, so he thinks it's a fight that he needs to do but he has to marry the loathly lady and ... [continues eagerly, but not clearly enough to transcribe].
- T Hold on, hold on, OK ... Right: when Sir Gawain thought he had to fight someone to save the king, he was brave *then*. So what have you come up with now?
- P3 I came up with that when King Arthur met that knight he was frightened but he didn't turn away and ride off but he still listened to what the Black Knight needed to say ...
- T Go on ...
- P3 And in the other story when M – said to her sister that there's a five-headed snake in the room, Nyasha was brave to go in to see if her sister was telling the truth, and she went in ...
- T I don't think she was brave. I think she was silly.
- P3 No Miss, I don't think she was silly ... because you know that M is not really a good character, she's sometimes a bad character, she sometimes lies, she can be lying that there's a five-headed snake and Nyasha has to go in to check whether she's telling the truth or not.
- T You know what? If someone tells me that there's a five-headed snake in a room I'm not going in there ... I'd be scared. I wouldn't, I think that was very silly of her to go in there ... Would *you* go in?
- P3 But Miss, Nyasha was brave to go in.
- T But I asked *you*, would *you* go in?
- P3 [Smiles] No.
- T Why wouldn't you go in?
- P3 [Smiles] Cos I ain't really brave.
- T [Laughs]

TALKING ABOUT TALK

Extract 13¹³

[Pupils are discussing with the teacher how they might apply what they have learned from the enhanced attention given to talk during the North Yorkshire dialogic teaching project].

- T You're agreeing with Amy in that respect.
- P1 Well and I think what was happening was like, while they were talking about what they've discovered, we just... Something caught our eye and so like, 'Oh that fits' and you're trying to get it in, waving your hand around. But it also means that while you're busy trying to get the attention you're not actually listening to the rest of it because there might be like a part an important bit that you miss out or something.
- T OK. How do you feel when you're working in this size group about the way people show or

¹³ Video, extract 23.

- don't show that they're listening to you?
- P2 I think we do listen to each other like, because of some of the filming we were like arguing with each other, but it was just so tempting to go, 'Oh Charlotte, look at what I found'. And you did. So that... Like Ralph said when you were reading your thing, you weren't listening to theirs. And I think it would be easier to like work in twos and threes instead of a bigger group. I think that we did... Apart from like not chipping in as much as we could have done, not listening, I think we would have done okay in a big group. I think we would have been quite ok and we would have done ok if we do it again.
- T What do you think about just the way you've been using your arms and hands in this session as opposed to the flailing arms of yesterday? Does it feel better or not? More comfortable, Hayden?
- P3 It feels more controlled, but like flying all over the place because that was... Distracts people doesn't it?
- T Okay.
- P3 But just like that [*raises hand minimally, keeping elbow on the table¹⁴*] I find that a lot better I think.
- T Well, how can you develop more positive and productive talk between yourselves without me interfering? At the moment you're all looking at me because I'm talking to you. Which is great. That's how it should be. It's super, lovely. But if it was just you guys talking and me not trying to chip in, how could you be a little bit more productive with that, Amy?
- P2 By making eye contact with you when you're talking or we're talking to you. You have to make eye contact with the other person across the table. So you could tell you were listening. And then the other people who were listening to what you two were saying, they would have to look at you and say like, 'Well, we know they're listening, we're ready to like go and we can work out this together without any help because we're all listening and we can tell that because we are making communication. We're communicating with each other.'
- T Okay, so if I set the camera up differently, you wouldn't be looking at me, you would be looking at... Maybe if you sat differently because obviously I've got half a table taken up with this [*the camera*] at the moment. So the setup might help, mightn't it?
- P2 You have to like move the camera to a certain corner so you could see everybody and it would be at certain angles and we'd really... We might be able to work because we'd have to listen to each other because there's like nobody there.
- T Would you like to stick with this size group or do you all feel really strongly that the smaller group would be better?
- PP Stick with this group.
- T Are you sure? Because, I mean I heard what you're saying and I appreciate what you're saying because you would have worked faster, maybe, in smaller groups yesterday. Ally?
- P4 Now I know all the flaws about working together. Now that I've seen the video. And we know

¹⁴ This teacher had encouraged her class to replace the outstretched arm waving with which UK pupils traditionally bid to answer questions by this more restrained gesture, having seen it in use in a videotaped extract from a Russian classroom (part of the data from Alexander, R.J. (2001) *Culture and Pedagogy*, Blackwell). Her pupils were very happy with the change.

not to do something or not to do something that we haven't done before.

- T We could try one of each maybe? Try working together as a group next time and then split you into smaller ones after that?
- P1 I think if we manage to like ... 'Cos you know we're talking about how we need to all listen and chip in?
- T Yes
- P1 Well, I think if we all just managed to listen and chip in enough, then you wouldn't like need to ask us questions to encourage us to chip in. Because that was mainly what was happening. You were encouraging us to chip in. But if we actually just listened, then it's pretty hard not to chip in.
- T That's true.